Association Between Urinary Triclosan With Bone Mass Density and Osteoporosis in US Adult Women, 2005–2010

Shaofang Cai,¹ Jiahao Zhu,² Lingling Sun,³ Chunhong Fan,² Yaohong Zhong,⁴ Qing Shen,⁴ and Yingjun Li^2

¹Department of Science and Education, Second Affiliated Hospital of Xiamen Medical College, Xiamen 361021, China; ²Department of Epidemiology and Health Statistics, Hangzhou Medical College School of Public Health, Hangzhou 310053, China; ³Centre for Orthopaedic Research, Orthopedics Research Institute of Zhejiang University, Department of Orthopaedics, Second Affiliated Hospital of Zhejiang University School of Medicine, Hangzhou 310053, China; and ⁴School of Public Health, Hangzhou Medical College, Hangzhou 310053, China

ORCiD numbers: 0000-0002-4835-8074 (Y. Li).

Context: Laboratory studies have demonstrated that triclosan (TCS) can cause significant interstitial collagen accumulation and an increase in trabecular bone. However, little is known about the relationship between TCS exposure and human bone health.

Methods: We used 2005 to 2010 National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey data to examine the association between urinary TCS concentration and bone mineral density (BMD) and osteoporosis in US adult women aged \geq 20 years. After inclusion and exclusion, 1848 women were analyzed.

Results: After adjustment for other covariates, we observed significant associations between tertile 3 of TCS concentration and lower BMD in regions of the total femur ($\beta = -0.016$; 95% CI = -0.032, -0.000), intertrochanteric region ($\beta = -0.022$; 95% CI = -0.042, -0.002), and lumbar spine ($\beta = -0.014$; 95% CI = -0.029, 0.001), respectively, relative to tertile 1. Compared with women at tertile 1, those at tertile 3 were more likely to have increased prevalence of osteoporosis in the intertrochanteric region (OR = 2.464; 95% CI = 1.190, 5.105).

Conclusion: This epidemiological study investigated the association between urinary TCS concentration and BMD and osteoporosis in US adult women. We found urinary TCS concentration was negatively associated with BMD and was positively associated with the prevalence of osteoporosis. The evidence was stronger in postmenopausal women than in premenopausal women. Future prospective studies are needed to validate these findings. (*J Clin Endocrinol Metab* 104: 4531–4538, 2019)

Osteoporosis is a metabolic bone disease characterized by decreased bone mineral density (BMD) and increased risk for fragility fractures, which result in negative effects on quality of life and increased mortality (1). It is reported that \sim 30% of postmenopausal women in the United States have osteoporosis, and 40% of them end up with fragility fractures (2). Fracture risk increases with age, and the incidence of hip fractures in US white women is among the highest in the world (3). Multiple factors contribute to reductions in bone mass and quality and lead to higher risk of fracture, including endogenous, environmental, and genetic factors (4). Emerging

ISSN Print 0021-972X ISSN Online 1945-7197 Printed in USA Copyright © 2019 Endocrine Society Received 9 March 2019. Accepted 3 June 2019. First Published Online 25 June 2019

Abbreviations: BMD, bone mineral density; DXA, dual-energy x-ray absorptiometry; EDC, endocrine disruptor chemical; NHANES, National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey; TCS, triclosan.

epidemiological evidence indicates a major relationship between environmental xenoestrogens, also known as endocrine disruptor chemicals (EDCs), and bone metabolism and different levels of BMD (5–8).

Triclosan (TCS) is an antimicrobial used in a variety of consumer goods and personal care products including soaps, hand sanitizers, toothpaste, and mouthwash. Environmental exposure usually comes from TCScontaining consumer products or TCS-contaminated water and/or animal/food products (9). Urinary TCS concentrations ranging from 7.9 nM to 13.1 μ M were detected in ~75% of the US population between 2003 and 2004 (10). Moreover, in many related studies, females were found to exhibit higher TCS concentrations than males (11, 12).

TCS is characterized as an EDC in multiple species, including humans (9). Some by-products of TCS, such as 2,4-dichlorophenol and 2,4,6-trichlorophenol, have endocrine disruptor activity (13, 14) and the potential to adversely affect levels of BMD. Laboratory studies have demonstrated that TCS can block *MMP-13* expression in parathyroid hormone–stimulated or prostaglandin E_2 – stimulated osteoblastic cell lines (15), which can result in substantial interstitial collagen accumulation and an increase in trabecular bone (16, 17). However, little is known about the relationship between TCS and human bone health.

To our knowledge, no study has examined the association between TCS and BMD and osteoporosis. In the current study, we investigated the association of BMD and osteoporosis with urinary TCS concentrations in US adult women.

Material and Methods

Study population

Data analyzed in the current study were obtained from the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES) (http://www.cdc.gov/nchs/nhanes.htm). Information such as demographic, dietary, and health-related data were collected through in-home interviews. Medical examination, physical examination, and laboratory test results from urine and blood samples were conducted by highly trained medical personnel. Detailed information on survey planning and design are described elsewhere (18). All participants provided informed consent at the time of recruitment. The NHANES protocol was reviewed and approved by the National Center for Health Statistics institutional review board.

To increase the sample size, three NHANES surveys conducted between 2005 and 2010 were combined when urinary TCS concentration and BMD values for the lumbar spine and proximal femur were available. We investigated associations between urinary TCS exposure and different levels of BMD in adult women. A total of 8829 women aged \geq 20 years participated. Urinary TCS concentrations were measured in only a subsample (n = 2759). Participants with missing values for urinary TCS (n = 106), BMD (n= 612), and other covariates (n = 193) were excluded in the final model. Ultimately, 1848 women aged \geq 20 years with complete data of interest were analyzed.

Assessment of urinary triclosan

For each study participant, a single spot urine specimen was collected during a physical examination at a mobile examination center. For laboratory analysis, urine samples were shipped on dry ice to the National Center for Environmental Health and stored at -70° C until analyzed (19). Urinary concentrations of free TCS plus conjugated TCS were measured using automated solid-phase extraction coupled to isotope dilution high-performance liquid chromatography-tandem mass spectrometry (10). The lower limit of detection was 2.3 ng/mL in the three surveys. Samples below the limit were assigned a level of lower limit of detection divided by the square root of 2. The creatinine-corrected urinary TCS values (microgram per gram creatinine) were analyzed to adjust for bias caused by dilution of the urine. Concentration of urine creatinine was measured using the Jaffe rate method (kinetic alkaline picrate) (20).

BMD measurement and osteoporosis

BMD (gram per square centimeter) was measured by dual-energy x-ray absorptiometry (DXA). The scan was conducted using a Hologic QDR-4500A fan-beam densitometer (21). BMD levels in the total femur, femur neck, trochanter, and intertrochanteric region in the femur and lumbar spine were examined separately by the NHANES team. Mean BMD of the lumbar spine was calculated from the first through the fourth lumbar vertebrae (8). The left hip was routinely scanned for regions of proximal femur. If a left-hip replacement or metal objects in the left leg were reported, the right hip was scanned. If participants reported fractures, replacements, or pins in both hips, they were excluded from the DXA scan. Otherwise, if participants were pregnant (positive urine pregnancy test and/or self-report), weighed >300 pounds, or had participated in nuclear medicine studies in the past 3 days, they were also excluded from the DXA scan (22).

We defined osteoporosis according to a diagnostic criterion recommended by the World Health Organization: BMD values <2.5 SDs below the mean values of the young reference group (23). In our study, osteoporosis was assessed separately in the total femur, femur neck, trochanter, intertrochanteric region, and overall. Osteoporosis in any of the four femoral regions was regarded as overall osteoporosis (7). The osteoporosis thresholds were 0.68, 0.59, 0.46, and 0.80 gm/cm² for the total femur, femur neck, trochanteric region, respectively.

Other covariates

Covariates were identified as potential confounders in our analysis as follows: age (years); race/ethnicity (non-Hispanic white, non-Hispanic black, Mexican American, other); education (less than high school, high school or equivalent, more than high school); marital status (married/cohabiting, widowed/divorced/separated, never married); physical activity during recreational time (sedentary, insufficient, moderate, high) (24); and smoking (never, ever, current). Daily calcium intake (tertiles); menopausal status (premenopausal, postmenopausal); and hormone use (yes, no) were recorded using interviewer-administered questionnaires. Body mass index

Statistical analysis

To account for the complex sampling design and to obtain appropriate SEs, weighted analyses were conducted according to the NHANES Analytic and Reporting Guidelines. Basic characteristics of participants are presented as mean (SE) or frequency (percentage).

Linear regression and logistic regression models were applied to analyze the association of urinary TCS concentration with BMD and osteoporosis, respectively. Linear regression models were constructed to estimate the association between urinary TCS concentration and BMD level with β -coefficients and corresponding 95% CIs. Logistic regression models were constructed to estimate the association between urinary TCS concentration and osteoporosis with ORs and corresponding 95% CIs. Sensitivity analysis was conducted by stratification of menopausal status to explore possible effect modifications.

All analyses were performed using STATA 15.1 (StataCorp LLC), while taking into account sample weights and design variables. P < 0.05 was regarded as statistical significant.

Results

Characteristics of participants

Table 1 shows the basic characteristics and urinary TCS level by menopausal status in the US adult women studied. The majority of subjects were non-Hispanic whites (72.23%), had an educational level greater than high school (57.84%), were married/cohabiting (62.19%), were normal weight (39.53%), were sedentary during recreational time (43.08%), were nonsmokers (56.51%), were without diabetes (91.43%), and did not use hormones (77.40%). Among 939 premenopausal women and 909 postmenopausal women, the mean age at interview and distributions of race/ ethnicity, education, marital status, smoking status, body mass index, physical activity, calcium intake, diabetes, and hormone use were all statistically different (P < 0.001). Geometric means of urinary TCS concentration were similar in different menopausal status groups (P = 0.625).

Among all 1848 women included, the weighted percentages of osteoporosis in the total femur, femur neck, trochanter, intertrochanteric region, and overall were 3.93% (n = 91), 4.82% (n = 111), 2.17% (n = 60), 4.09%(n = 91), and 6.36% (n = 143), respectively [see (26)].

Associations between urinary TCS and BMD

Table 2 presents associations between urinary TCS concentration and BMD in the femur and lumbar spine. In tertile analyses, after adjustment for other covariates, significant associations were found between tertile 3 for TCS

concentration and lower BMD in regions of the total femur $(\beta = -0.016; 95\% \text{ CI} = -0.032, -0.000)$, intertrochanteric region ($\beta = -0.022$; 95% CI = -0.042, -0.002), and lumbar spine ($\beta = -0.014$; 95% CI = -0.029, 0.001), respectively, relative to tertile 1. These negative associations strengthened among postmeno pausal women. However, they disappeared among premenopausal women; that is, except for BMD in the trochanter, lower BMD in all other regions was significantly associated with tertile 2 ($\beta = -0.024$; 95% CI = -0.045, -0.002 in the total femur; $\beta = -0.029$; 95% CI = -0.051, -0.006 in the femur neck; $\beta = -0.025$; 95% CI = -0.051, -0.000 in the intertrochanteric region; and $\beta = -0.023$; 95% CI = -0.044, -0.003 in the lumbar spine) and with tertile 3 ($\beta = -0.028$; 95% CI = -0.052, -0.005 in the total femur; $\beta = -0.029$; 95% CI = -0.049, -0.008 in the femur neck; $\beta = -0.036$; 95% CI = -0.065, -0.008 in the intertrochanteric region; and $\beta = -0.027$; 95% CI = -0.049, -0.005 in the lumbar spine) compared with tertile 1 in postmenopausal women.

Associations between urinary TCS and osteoporosis

Tertiles of urinary TCS concentration in participants with or without osteoporosis are presented in an online repository (26). We further explored the associations between urinary TCS concentration and osteoporosis in different bone sites as shown in Table 3. Compared with women at tertile 1, those at tertile 3 were more likely to have increased prevalence of osteoporosis in the intertrochanteric region (OR = 2.464; 95% CI = 1.190, 5.105). We did not observe statistically significant associations for different levels of urinary TCS with osteoporosis in the other three regions or overall. As shown in the online repository (26), the numbers of osteoporosis cases in the total femur, femur neck, trochanter, intertrochanteric region, and overall were only three, five, two, four, and seven, respectively, in premenopausal women. Further analysis for osteoporosis was conducted only in postmenopausal women. The result was similar to that in all adult women (OR = 2.250; 95% CI = 1.059, 4.782).

Discussion

Our epidemiological study investigated the association between urinary TCS concentration and BMD and osteoporosis in US adult women. We found urinary TCS concentration was negatively associated with BMD and positively associated with prevalence of osteoporosis. The evidence was stronger in postmenopausal women than in premenopausal women.

It has been demonstrated that thyroid hormone signaling is important for normal skeletal development and

| Characteristics | All Women (n = 1848) | Premenopausal Women (n = 939) | Postmenopausal Women (n = 909) | P Value ^a |
|----------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------|
| Age, mean ±SE | 47.71 ±0.48 | 36.20 ±0.41 | 62.44 ±0.48 | < 0.001 ^b |
| Race/ethnicity, n (%) | | | | |
| Non-Hispanic white | 924 (72.23) | 430 (67.08) | 494 (78.83) | < 0.001 |
| Non-Hispanic black | 354 (10.80) | 179 (11.57) | 175 (9.83) | |
| Mexican American | 331 (6.88) | 187 (8.55) | 144 (4.74) | |
| Other | 239 (10.09) | 143 (12.81) | 96 (6.60) | |
| Education, n (%) | | | | |
| Less than high school | 479 (16.90) | 204 (14.40) | 275 (20.08) | < 0.001 |
| High school or equivalent | 458 (25.26) | 211 (22.15) | 247 (29.26) | |
| More than high school | 911 (57.84) | 524 (63.45) | 387 (50.66) | |
| Marital status, n (%) | | | | |
| Married/cohabiting | 1032 (62.19) | 556 (64.20) | 476 (59.60) | < 0.001 |
| Widowed/divorced/separated | 511 (22.50) | 135 (12.84) | 376 (34.86) | |
| Never married | 305 (15.31) | 248 (22.95) | 57 (5.54) | |
| Smoking status, n (%) | 565 (15.51) | 210 (22.55) | 57 (5.51) | |
| Never | 1102 (56.51) | 587 (59.30) | 515 (52.94) | < 0.001 |
| Ever | 356 (21.88) | 110 (14.69) | 246 (31.07) | 0.001 |
| Current | 390 (21.61) | 242 (26.01) | 148 (15.99) | |
| BMI, n (%) | 556 (21.61) | 242 (20.01) | 140 (13.55) | |
| Normal | 626 (39.53) | 367 (43.89) | 259 (33.96) | < 0.001 |
| Overweight | 586 (29.91) | 274 (29.04) | 312 (31.03) | <0.001 |
| Obese | 636 (30.56) | 298 (27.08) | 338 (35.01) | |
| Physical activity during | 030 (30.30) | 250 (27.00) | 556 (55.61) | |
| recreational time, n (%) | | | | |
| Sedentary | 948 (43.08) | 416 (37.77) | 532 (49.89) | < 0.001 |
| Insufficient | 310 (18.72) | 164 (19.16) | 146 (18.16) | <0.001 |
| Moderate | 221 (14.03) | 111 (13.33) | 110 (14.93) | |
| High | 369 (24.16) | 248 (29.75) | 121 (17.01) | |
| Calcium, n (%) | 505 (24.10) | 248 (23.73) | 121 (17:01) | |
| Tertile 1 | 618 (31.40) | 297 (30.02) | 321 (33.16) | < 0.001 |
| Tertile 2 | 632 (34.11) | 287 (31.16) | 345 (37.88) | <0.001 |
| Tertile 3 | 598 (34.50) | 355 (38.82) | 243 (28.97) | |
| Diabetes, n (%) | 598 (34.50) | 555 (58.82) | 243 (28.97) | |
| Yes | 215 (8.57) | 901 (96.71) | 732 (84.67) | <0.001 |
| No | 1633 (91.43) | 38 (3.29) | 177 (15.33) | <u>∖0.001</u> |
| Hormone use, n (%) | 1055 (91.45) | 50 (5.23) | 1// (13.33) | |
| | 400 (22 60) | 20(4.82) | 270 (45 26) | < 0.001 |
| Yes No | 400 (22.60) | 30 (4.83) | 370 (45.36) | <0.001 |
| | 1448 (77.40) | 909 (95.17) 17 05 (15 06 - 20 20) | 539 (54.64) | |
| Triclosan, GM (95% CI) | 17.58 (16.15, 19.14) | 17.95 (15.96, 20.20) | 17.21 (15.23, 19.44) | 0.625 ^c |

Table 1. Basic Characteristics and Urinary Triclosan Level by Menopausal Status in US Adult Women,NHANES 2005–2010

Triclosan, urinary triclosan (microgram per gram creatinine).

Abbreviations: BMI, body mass index; GM, geometric mean; n, numbers of subjects; NHANES, National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey; %, weighted proportion.

 ${}^{a}\chi^{2}$ test was used to compare proportions between premenopausal and postmenopausal women.

^bA linear regression model was constructed with age as the dependent variable and menopause status as an independent variable.

^cA linear regression model was constructed with log-transformed triclosan levels as dependent variables and menopausal status as an independent variable.

adult bone maintenance (27). Thyrotoxicosis is considered an important reason for secondary osteoporosis and increased risk of fracture in adults (28). Alteration of thyroid function has been associated with lower BMD and higher risk of fracture in postmenopausal women (29). As a halogenated biphenyl ether, TCS can cause several modifications in the thyroid axis of adult zebrafish by sharing structural similarity with T4 (30, 31), including thyroid tissue inactivation, increased level of pituitary TSH, and thyroid tissue hyperplasia (32). Therefore, we speculated that disruption in the thyroid axis caused by exogenous compounds such as TCS could lead to lower BMD and increased prevalence of osteoporosis in US adult women.

Estrogens play crucial roles in regulating osteoblast activity and differentiation by enhancing the process of osteogenic differentiation, stimulating differentiation from preosteoblasts to osteoblasts, and prolonging osteoblast and osteocyte life span by suppressing apoptosis in cultured mesenchymal stem cells (33). In addition,

| | | | BMD | | |
|---------------------------------------|--|--|-----------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|
| Triclosan | Total Femur β (95% Cl) | Femur Neck β (95% Cl) | Trochanter β (95% Cl) | Intertrochanteric Region eta (95% Cl) | Lumbar Spine β (95% Cl) |
| Total women ^a Tertile 1 | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference |
| Tertile 2 | -0.011 (-0.028, 0.007) | -0.010 (-0.028, 0.008) | -0.006 (-0.022, 0.010) | -0.012 (-0.032, 0.008) | -0.010 (-0.027, 0.007) |
| Tertile 3 | $-0.016(-0.032, -0.000)^{b}$ | -0.010 (-0.024, 0.004) | -0.009 (-0.023, 0.006) | $-0.022(-0.042, -0.002)^{b}$ | $-0.014(-0.029, 0.001)^{b}$ |
| Premenopausal women ^c | | | | | |
| Tertile 1 | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference |
| Tertile 2 | -0.002 (-0.027, 0.023) | 0.004 (-0.021, 0.028) | 0.000 (-0.021, 0.022) | -0.003 (-0.034, 0.028) | -0.000 (-0.025, 0.024) |
| Tertile 3 | -0.008 (-0.032, 0.015) | 0.004 (-0.021, 0.028) | -0.005 (-0.026, 0.016) | -0.012 (-0.040, 0.016) | -0.005 (-0.029, 0.018) |
| Postmenopausal women ^c | | | | | |
| Tertile 1 | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference |
| Tertile 2 | $-0.024 (-0.045, -0.002)^{b}$ | $-0.029 (-0.051, -0.006)^{b}$ | -0.016 (-0.036, 0.004) | $-0.025(-0.051, -0.000)^{b}$ | $-0.023(-0.044, -0.003)^{b}$ |
| Tertile 3 | -0.028 (-0.052, -0.005) ^b | -0.029 (0.049, -0.008) ^b | -0.015 (-0.035, 0.006) | $-0.036(-0.065, -0.008)^{b}$ | -0.027 (-0.049, -0.005) ^b |
| Abbreviations: NHANES, Natio | Abbreviations: NHANES, National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey; $m{eta}$, coefficient. | on Survey; $oldsymbol{eta}$, coefficient. | | . NHANES, National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey; $m{eta}$, coefficient. | |

Association Between Urinary Triclosan Level and BMD Among US Adult Women by Menopausal Status, NHANES 2005–2010

Table 2.

^aLinear regression adjusted for age (5-year intervals); race (non-Hispanic white, non-Hispanic black, Mexican American, other); educational level (less than high school), high school), more than high school); marital status (married/cohabiting, widowed/divorced/separated, never married); smoking (never, ever, current); body mass index (normal weight, overweight, obese); physical activity (sedentary, insufficient, moderate, high); calcium intake (tertile 1, tertile 2, tertile 3); diabetes (yes, no); hormone use (yes, no); and menopause (yes, no).

 $^{b}P < 0.05.$

^cLinear regression was adjusted for the same covariates except for menopausal status.

Table 3. Association Between Urinary Triclosan Level and Osteoporosis Among US Adult Women byMenopausal Status, NHANES 2005–2010

| Osteoporosis | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| Triclosan | Total femur OR (95% Cl) | Femur neck OR (95% CI) | Trochanter OR (95% CI) | Intertrochanteric region OR (95% CI) | Overall ^a OR (95% CI) | | | |
| Total women ^b | | | | | | | | |
| Tertile 1 | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference | | | |
| Tertile 2 | 0.891 (0.407, 1.951) | 1.112 (0.577, 2.141) | 0.724 (0.293, 1.793) | 1.298 (0.590, 2.859) | 1.206 (0.659, 2.206) | | | |
| Tertile 3 | 1.607 (0.794, 3.252) | 1.287 (0.706, 2.347) | 1.551 (0.727, 3.307) | 2.464 (1.190, 5.105) ^c | 1.656 (0.950, 2.885) | | | |
| Postmenopausal women ^d | | | | | | | | |
| Tertile 1 | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference | Reference | | | |
| Tertile 2 | 0.870 (0.395, 1.919) | 1.099 (0.537, 2.250) | 0.700 (0.274, 1.788) | 1.328 (0.592, 2.978) | 1.238 (0.658, 2.328) | | | |
| Tertile 3 | 1.376 (0.669, 2.833) | 1.135 (0.584, 2.205) | 1.267 (0.560, 2.866) | 2.250 (1.059, 4.782) ^c | 1.555 (0.841, 2.875) | | | |

Abbreviation: NHANES, National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey.

^aOverall osteoporosis was defined as osteoporosis in any femoral region of interest.

^bLogistic regression was adjusted for age (5-year intervals); race (non-Hispanic white, non-Hispanic black, Mexican American, other); educational level (less than high school, high school, more than high school); marital status (married/cohabiting, widowed/divorced/separated, never married); smoking (never, ever, current); body mass index (normal weight, overweight, obese); physical activity (sedentary, insufficient, moderate, high); calcium intake (tertile 1, tertile 2, tertile 3); diabetes (yes, no); hormone use (yes, no); and menopause (yes, no). $^{c}P < 0.05$.

^dLogistic regression was adjusted for the same covariates except for menopausal status.

estrogens promote insulin-like growth factor 1 and transforming growth factor- β production by osteoblasts as well as procollagen synthesis (34). TCS is one of the suspected EDCs with potential estrogenic activity (35, 36). Several *in vitro* studies demonstrated that TCS had antiestrogenic effects in transactivation and proliferative assays in human cells (37, 38). Thus, in US adult women, TCS exposure may adversely influence BMD and osteoporosis through its antiestrogenic effect.

Nojiri et al. (39) found that cytoplasmic superoxide could distinctly reduce bone stiffness and decrease BMD in vivo. They also showed that intracellular oxidative stress could induce cell apoptosis and reduce cell proliferation in primary osteoblasts but not in osteoclasts in in vitro experiments. Impaired osteoblast viability reduced osteoblast number and suppressed receptor activator of nuclear factor- κ ß ligand and recombinant human macrophage colony stimulating factor (RANKL/M-CSF) osteoclastogenic signaling in bone. It was reported that TCS at sublethal concentrations could induce oxidative stress, decreasing cellular thiol content and increasing intracellular Zn²⁺ concentration by Zn^{2+} release from intracellular stores in rat thymocytes (40). Cellular analysis suggested that TCS can inhibit the nuclear localization of SKN-1/Nrf2 and the expression of its target genes, which have been associated with oxidative stress response in human mesenchymal stem cells. Moreover, TCS-induced toxicity could be significantly reduced either by antioxidant treatment or constitutive SKN-1/Nrf2 activation (41). Therefore, TCS-related oxidative stress may have an effect on decreased BMD levels and osteoporosis.

Postmenopausal osteoporosis is the most common type of osteoporosis, resulting mainly from estrogen deficiency. After menopause, rapid bone loss appears, with an annual bone loss rate of 3% to 5% for 5 to 10 years because of reduced ovarian production of estrogens in women, affecting primarily trabecular bone (42). On the other hand, significantly increased alterations in oxidative balance occur during the menopausal transition. Changes in oxidative balance may be related to endocrine menopausal changes along with aging (43). These may partly explain the phenomenon that the association between TCS concentration and BMD and osteoporosis was more pronounced in postmenopausal women than in all adult women.

There are several limitations to this study. First, we used a cross-sectional design, which was not suitable for establishing cause-and-effect relationships. Second, because TCS is usually rapidly metabolized and excreted (44), TCS measurement in spot urine samples may not represent intraindividual variability and average long-term exposure. Moreover, repeated measurements and long-time observation of BMD are needed to capture the health status of bone because bone maintenance is a continuous process. In addition, there may have been errors in measurement of BMD and other confounding variables. Finally, we found a significantly elevated prevalence of osteoporosis (tertile 3 vs tertile 1) only in the intertrochanteric region, which correlates with the fact that maximal reduction in BMD (tertile 3 vs tertile 1) occurred in the intertrochanteric region. This may indicate that TCS exposure has more influence on the intertrochanteric region than on other regions of the femur;

however, no mechanistic studies supporting our hypothesis have been found.

In summary, we provide evidence that urinary TCS concentration was significantly associated with BMD and osteoporosis in US adult women. Higher TCS exposure was associated with lower BMD in the total femur, intertrochanteric region, and lumbar spine and with a higher prevalence of osteoporosis in the intertrochanteric region. The association was more pronounced in postmenopausal women. Future prospective studies are needed to validate the findings.

Acknowledgments

We thank members of the National Center for Health Statistics of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and the participants who enrolled in the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey.

Financial Support: This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (grant no. 81702118; to L.S.) and the Medical Science and Technology Project of Zhejiang Province (grant no. 2018260185; to L.S.).

Correspondence and Reprint Requests: Yingjun Li, PhD, Department of Epidemiology and Health Statistics, Hangzhou Medical College School of Public Health, 481 Binwen Road, Hangzhou 310053, China. E-mail: yingjunguqing2006@ 126.com.

Disclosure Summary: The authors have nothing to disclose.

References and Notes

- Lorentzon M, Nilsson AG, Johansson H, Kanis JA, Mellström D, Sundh D. Extensive undertreatment of osteoporosis in older Swedish women. Osteoporos Int. 2019;30(6):1297–1305.
- Vidal M, Thibodaux RJ, Neira LFV, Messina OD. Osteoporosis: a clinical and pharmacological update. *Clin Rheumatol*. 2019;38(2): 385–395.
- Kanis JA, Odén A, McCloskey EV, Johansson H, Wahl DA, Cooper C; IOF Working Group on Epidemiology and Quality of Life. A systematic review of hip fracture incidence and probability of fracture worldwide. Osteoporos Int. 2012;23(9):2239–2256.
- Hendrickx G, Boudin E, Van Hul W. A look behind the scenes: the risk and pathogenesis of primary osteoporosis. *Nat Rev Rheumatol.* 2015;11(8):462–474.
- Hodgson S, Thomas L, Fattore E, Lind PM, Alfven T, Hellström L, Håkansson H, Carubelli G, Fanelli R, Jarup L. Bone mineral density changes in relation to environmental PCB exposure. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2008;116(9):1162–1166.
- Min KB, Min JY. Urinary phthalate metabolites and the risk of low bone mineral density and osteoporosis in older women. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2014;99(10):E1997–E2003.
- Guo J, Huang Y, Bian S, Zhao C, Jin Y, Yu D, Wu X, Zhang D, Cao W, Jing F, Chen G. Associations of urinary polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons with bone mass density and osteoporosis in U.S. adults, NHANES 2005-2010. *Environ Pollut*. 2018;240:209–218.
- Khalil N, Chen A, Lee M, Czerwinski SA, Ebert JR, DeWitt JC, Kannan K. Association of perfluoroalkyl substances, bone mineral density, and osteoporosis in the U.S. population in NHANES 2009-2010. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2016;124(1):81–87.

- Weatherly LM, Gosse JA. Triclosan exposure, transformation, and human health effects. *J Toxicol Environ Health B Crit Rev.* 2017; 20(8):447–469.
- Calafat AM, Ye X, Wong LY, Reidy JA, Needham LL. Urinary concentrations of triclosan in the U.S. population: 2003-2004. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2008;116(3):303–307.
- 11. Heffernan AL, Baduel C, Toms LM, Calafat AM, Ye X, Hobson P, Broomhall S, Mueller JF. Use of pooled samples to assess human exposure to parabens, benzophenone-3 and triclosan in Queensland, Australia. *Environ Int.* 2015;85:77–83.
- 12. Yin J, Wei L, Shi Y, Zhang J, Wu Q, Shao B. Chinese population exposure to triclosan and triclocarban as measured via human urine and nails. *Environ Geochem Health*. 2016;38(5):1125–1135.
- Fang Y, Gao X, Zhao F, Zhang H, Zhang W, Yang H, Lin B, Xi Z. Comparative proteomic analysis of ovary for Chinese rare minnow (*Gobiocypris rarus*) exposed to chlorophenol chemicals. J Proteomics. 2014;110:172–182.
- Ma Y, Liu C, Lam PK, Wu RS, Giesy JP, Hecker M, Zhang X, Zhou B. Modulation of steroidogenic gene expression and hormone synthesis in H295R cells exposed to PCP and TCP. *Toxicology*. 2011;282(3):146–153.
- 15. Shiue I. Urinary heavy metals, phthalates, phenols, thiocyanate, parabens, pesticides, polyaromatic hydrocarbons but not arsenic or polyfluorinated compounds are associated with adult oral health: USA NHANES, 2011-2012. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int.* 2015; 22(20):15636–15645.
- Inada M, Wang Y, Byrne MH, Rahman MU, Miyaura C, López-Otín C, Krane SM. Critical roles for collagenase-3 (Mmp13) in development of growth plate cartilage and in endochondral ossification. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*. 2004;101(49):17192–17197.
- Stickens D, Behonick DJ, Ortega N, Heyer B, Hartenstein B, Yu Y, Fosang AJ, Schorpp-Kistner M, Angel P, Werb Z. Altered endochondral bone development in matrix metalloproteinase 13deficient mice. *Development*. 2004;131(23):5883–5895.
- Curtin LR, Mohadjer LK, Dohrmann SM, Kruszon-Moran D, Mirel LB, Carroll MD, Hirsch R, Burt VL, Johnson CL. National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey: sample design, 2007-2010. Vital Health Stat 2. 2013;(160):1–23.
- Ye X, Kuklenyik Z, Needham LL, Calafat AM. Automated on-line column-switching HPLC-MS/MS method with peak focusing for the determination of nine environmental phenols in urine. *Anal Chem.* 2005;77(16):5407–5413.
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Laboratory procedure manual: creatinine. Available at: http://www.cdc.gov/NCHS/data/ nhanes/nhanes_09_10/BIOPRO_F_met_creatinine.pdf. Accessed 16 January 2019.
- 21. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey: dual energy X-ray absorptiometry (DXA) procedures manual. Available at: https://wwwn.cdc.gov/ nchs/data/nhanes/2007-2008/manuals/manual_dexa.pdf. Accessed 16 January 2019.
- 22. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey: 2009-2010 data documentation, codebook, and frequencies: dual energy X-ray absorptiometry– femur (DXXFEM_F). Available at: https://wwwn.cdc.gov/Nchs/ Nhanes/2009-2010/DXXFEM_F.htm. Accessed 16 January 2019.
- Looker AC, Orwoll ES, Johnston CC Jr, Lindsay RL, Wahner HW, Dunn WL, Calvo MS, Harris TB, Heyse SP. Prevalence of low femoral bone density in older U.S. adults from NHANES III. *J Bone Miner Res.* 1997;12(11):1761–1768.
- 24. Tucker LA. Physical activity and telomere length in U.S. men and women: an NHANES investigation. *Prev Med.* 2017;100: 145–151.
- 25. American Diabetes Association. *Standards of Medical Care in Diabetes-2019* abridged for primary care providers. *Clin Diabetes*. 2019;37(1):11–34.

- 26. Cai S, Zhu J, Sun L, Fan C, Zhong Y, Shen Q, Li Y. Data from: Association between urinary triclosan with bone mass density and osteoporosis in US adult women, 2005-2010. Harvard Dataverse, V1. Deposited 14 May 2019. https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/ JDEWWX.
- 27. Bassett JH, Williams GR. Role of thyroid hormones in skeletal development and bone maintenance. *Endocr Rev.* 2016;37(2): 135–187.
- Bours SP, van Geel TA, Geusens PP, Janssen MJ, Janzing HM, Hoffland GA, Willems PC, van den Bergh JP. Contributors to secondary osteoporosis and metabolic bone diseases in patients presenting with a clinical fracture. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab.* 2011; 96(5):1360–1367.
- Mazziotti G, Porcelli T, Patelli I, Vescovi PP, Giustina A. Serum TSH values and risk of vertebral fractures in euthyroid postmenopausal women with low bone mineral density. *Bone.* 2010; 46(3):747–751.
- 30. Crofton KM, Paul KB, Devito MJ, Hedge JM. Short-term *in vivo* exposure to the water contaminant triclosan: evidence for disruption of thyroxine. *Environ Toxicol Pharmacol.* 2007;24(2):194–197.
- 31. Dann AB, Hontela A. Triclosan: environmental exposure, toxicity and mechanisms of action. J Appl Toxicol. 2011;31(4):285–311.
- Boas M, Feldt-Rasmussen U, Skakkebaek NE, Main KM. Environmental chemicals and thyroid function. *Eur J Endocrinol*. 2006; 154(5):599–611.
- 33. Mayahara M, Sasaki T. Cellular mechanism of inhibition of osteoclastic resorption of bone and calcified cartilage by long-term pamidronate administration in ovariectomized mature rats. *Anat Rec A Discov Mol Cell Evol Biol.* 2003;274A(1):817–826.
- 34. Martin A, Yu J, Xiong J, Khalid AB, Katzenellenbogen B, Kim SH, Katzenellenbogen JA, Malaivijitnond S, Gabet Y, Krum SA, Frenkel B. Estrogens and androgens inhibit association of RANKL with the pre-osteoblast membrane through post-translational mechanisms. J Cell Physiol. 2017;232(12):3798–3807.
- 35. Huang H, Du G, Zhang W, Hu J, Wu D, Song L, Xia Y, Wang X. The *in vitro* estrogenic activities of triclosan and triclocarban. *J Appl Toxicol.* 2014;34(9):1060–1067.
- 36. Abd-Elhakim YM, Mohammed AT, Ali HA. Impact of subchronic exposure to triclosan and/or fluoride on estrogenic activity in

immature female rats: the expression pattern of calbindin-D9k and estrogen receptor α genes. *J Biochem Mol Toxicol.* 2018;**32**(2): e22027.

- 37. Henry ND, Fair PA. Comparison of *in vitro* cytotoxicity, estrogenicity and anti-estrogenicity of triclosan, perfluorooctane sulfonate and perfluorooctanoic acid. *J Appl Toxicol*. 2013;33(4): 265–272.
- 38. Ahn KC, Zhao B, Chen J, Cherednichenko G, Sanmarti E, Denison MS, Lasley B, Pessah IN, Kültz D, Chang DP, Gee SJ, Hammock BD. *In vitro* biologic activities of the antimicrobials triclocarban, its analogs, and triclosan in bioassay screens: receptor-based bioassay screens. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2008; 116(9):1203–1210.
- 39. Nojiri H, Saita Y, Morikawa D, Kobayashi K, Tsuda C, Miyazaki T, Saito M, Marumo K, Yonezawa I, Kaneko K, Shirasawa T, Shimizu T. Cytoplasmic superoxide causes bone fragility owing to low-turnover osteoporosis and impaired collagen cross-linking. *J Bone Miner Res.* 2011;26(11):2682–2694.
- 40. Tamura I, Kanbara Y, Saito M, Horimoto K, Satoh M, Yamamoto H, Oyama Y. Triclosan, an antibacterial agent, increases intracellular Zn²⁺ concentration in rat thymocytes: its relation to oxidative stress. *Chemosphere*. 2012;86(1):70–75.
- 41. Yoon DS, Choi Y, Cha DS, Zhang P, Choi SM, Alfhili MA, Polli JR, Pendergrass D, Taki FA, Kapalavavi B, Pan X, Zhang B, Blackwell TK, Lee JW, Lee MH. Triclosan disrupts SKN-1/Nrf2-mediated oxidative stress response in *C. elegans* and human mesenchymal stem cells. *Sci Rep.* 2017;7(1):12592.
- 42. Eastell R, O'Neill TW, Hofbauer LC, Langdahl B, Reid IR, Gold DT, Cummings SR. Postmenopausal osteoporosis. *Nat Rev Dis Primers*. 2016;2(1):16069.
- 43. Pansini F, Cervellati C, Guariento A, Stacchini MA, Castaldini C, Bernardi A, Pascale G, Bonaccorsi G, Patella A, Bagni B, Mollica G, Bergamini CM. Oxidative stress, body fat composition, and endocrine status in pre- and postmenopausal women. *Menopause*. 2008;15(1):112–118.
- 44. Sandborgh-Englund G, Adolfsson-Erici M, Odham G, Ekstrand J. Pharmacokinetics of triclosan following oral ingestion in humans. *J Toxicol Environ Health A*. 2006;69(20):1861–1873.